

Columbus Historiography

Reactions to Howard Zinn and Robert Royal

Howard Zinn and Robert Royal are historians who have written overviews of major events surrounding Columbus's voyages of discovery and who have offered their interpretations of the meaning of these events. Their perspectives differ greatly.

Your Task: In order to further analyze the differences between these two authors and to assess the validity of the arguments they make, you are to write a two-part analysis of these historians. In the first part, you should write from the perspective of Howard Zinn and critique one argument made by Robert Royal. In the second part, you should write from Robert Royal's perspective and critique one argument made by Howard Zinn. Each critique should be no more than one page in length, double-spaced (two pages total).

Reminders:

- Do not be vague in your analysis. It is not sufficient to say you think the writer you are discussing is "wrong" or to concentrate on writing style, readability, etc. You should be assessing specific lines of argument and explaining why they do not fit with the other author's analysis.
- Do not analyze more than one argument. You should be going into depth critiquing one argument rather than breaking down several ideas superficially.
- As this assignment calls for you to write from another person's point of view, first person is acceptable, but these critiques can be written strictly from the third person. Second person (you, your, etc.) is NOT acceptable.
- Avoid clichés. The use of comparisons and colorful language can improve your writing, but it does not compensate for ineffective analysis. "Hypothetical" arguments and rhetorical questions should also not be utilized.
- Check spelling, grammar, and punctuation before submitting.

Point value: 30 points

Due: Wednesday, September 9

This assignment must be posted onto the class's turnitin.com account in September, so be sure to retain an electronic file!

Please contact Mrs. Dolan (jdolan@chclc.org) or Mrs. Mikulski (mmikulski@chclc.org) with any questions.